DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 419 088 CE 076 112

AUTHOR Mahomed, Nisaar
TITLE The Integration of Education and Training in South Africa within the Context of Labour Market Theories and Globalisation.
INSTITUTION Natal Univ., Durban (South Africa). Education Policy Unit.
REPORT NO EPU-WP-11
ISBN ISBN-1-86840-229-0
PUB DATE 1996-12-00
NOTE 58p.
AVAILABLE FROM Education Policy Unit, University of Natal, Durban 4041, South Africa ($7).
PUB TYPE Reports - Research (143)
EDRS PRICE EDRS Price MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS Adult Education; Articulation (Education); *Capitalism; Developing Nations; *Economic Development; Educational Development; Foreign Countries; Global Approach; *Job Training; *Labor Market; Lifelong Learning; Postsecondary Education; *Racial Integration; Secondary Education; *Vocational Education
IDENTIFIERS *South Africa

ABSTRACT

The issue of integration of education and training is emerging at this particular period in South Africa's (SA's) history due to the changing global and domestic economic context. The Regulation Theory provides a rigorous analytical framework for understanding the relationship between education and the economy and for explaining the crisis in SA's capitalism. It shows how capitalism mutates, becoming stronger rather than weaker after successive crises. The SA economy has experienced the following: phenomenal growth from the early 1960s to mid-1970s; slower growth in the remainder of the 1970s with economic recession; a boom between 1978-82; and a deep recession in the mid-1980s. SA lacks a training culture because of the short-term perspective of industry, voluntarist industrial training policies, and low priority placed on work force training. Development however, continues on curriculum frameworks for general and further education and training, adult basic education and training, and on the relationship between lifelong learning and National Qualifications Framework. Proposals regarding mobility within the postsecondary and tertiary education sectors show unions, the African National Conference, state, and employers are united in their demand for greater student flow within an enlarged postsecondary and training sector. However, they disagree about the extent to which cross-institutional accreditation would provide effective linkages with postsecondary institutions. (56 references) (YLB)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

The Integration of Education and Training in South Africa within the Context of Labour Market Theories and Globalisation

by Nisaar Mahomed

Published by the Education Policy Unit
University of Natal
Durban 4041
South Africa
Tel: (031) 260-2607
Fax: (031) 260-2118
email: sharman@mtb.und.ac.za

Copyright © 1996: Education Policy Unit

ISBN: 1-86840-229-0

CONTENTS

	PAGE
Introduction	1
The South African Economy - The Last Three Decades	6
Training Boards in South Africa	17
The State and Educational Reform	22
Alternative Economic Growth Models for South Africa	29
International Influences	42
Conclusion	44
List of Works Cited	46
Appendix	

INTRODUCTION

After the student protests in June 1976, education became a site of contestation between the government and those forces opposed to it. With the proliferation of non-government organisations in the 1980s, the issue of adult basic education began to creep into the political discourse.

Much has been written about the debilitating effects of South Africa's nineteen racially divided education departments, but while events in the formal educational arena have been well documented, the training field has been left virtually untouched, even by the trade unions. However, towards the end of the 1980s there was a groundswell of opinion in favour of an investigation into South Africa's training system. By the time the ANC government came to power in 1994, training had climbed to the top of the political agenda, alongside education.

This trend has been reinforced by the rapid opening up and integration of the world's markets and the subsequent need for increasing productivity in order to make South African goods and services more productive internationally. Common in most reform initiatives worldwide is the need to 'adapt ET [Education and Training] systems to the changing economic environment' (Finegold and Soskice, 1991:214). One of the major stategies put forward as a solution to improved productivity in South Africa has been the integration of Education and Training (ET).

In a recent article, Motala (1995) outlined a few strategies for achieving the integration of ET. Although it is an insightful work, detailing the rationale for integration as well as

highlighting possible threats to the process, it falls short in two crucial areas. It does not locate the issue of integration historically, i.e. showing the different influences that were brought to bear on the whole process, and it fails to locate integration within the changing global and domestic economic context. In an attempt to explain how the issue of integration emerged at this particular period in South Africa's history, this paper addresses these two issues.

In looking at the issue of integration, this paper relies on the Regulation Approach, which provides a rigorous analytical framework, not only for understanding the relationship between education and the economy, but also for explaining the crisis in South African capitalism.

Regulation Theory

The relationship between the economy and education is a complex one that continues to befuddle educational theory. This relationship is supported by an institutional approach that views vocational education and training (VET) as being determined by a complex network of capitalist institutions and the social relations embedded in these institutions.

The Regulation Approach emerged in France in the 1970s. As a theory of capitalist accumulation, it sought to:

> *explain how and why capitalist economies came to be transformed in the course of their development* (Gelb, 1991:8).

For this school of thought, the behaviour of economic agents is a product of social forces. Both the French regulation

school and the United States (US) social structures of accumulation school (SSA) provide interesting analyses regarding the social processes occurring within the institutional sphere. Regulation theory sees a mode of regulation as the network of:

> *social institutions, structures and norms which act to regulate the behaviour of economic agents'* (Kraak, 1991:1).

This mode consists of that wide range of social processes that organise and influence the multi-faceted conflicts amongst classes and other social groups. Both approaches share the view that this network of institutional relations ensures the conditions for relatively long term capitalist prosperity and stability. According to this theory whenever crises emerge, either globally, as in 1973, or nationally, as in South Africa during the 1980s, they are the result of incoherence within the mode of regulation due to a malfunctioning of the institutional elements. This is followed by a period of institutional restructuring to ensure the installation of a new mode of capitalist regulation.

Another contributor to the debate is the French Societal Analysis School, who argue that distinctive national structures of educational provision, methods of work (re)organisation and the institutional arrangements of industrial relations affect the manner in which skills are defined and most importantly, provided for. This approach illustrates the power of the 'interlocking network of societal institutions' which can act to impede the reform of VET (Kraak, 1991:3).

It should be noted that the quality and efficacy of VET is determined, not only by what occurs within VET institutions, but also by the broader network of institutional forces that impact on VET. The American school defines SSA as the combination of capitalist social relations and the institutions which provide a societal form to those relations. These institutional forms provide the terrain upon which relationships between and among capitalists, between capitalists and workers, among workers and lastly, between the government and the economy, unfold. Key 'institutions' or role players are the state, the labour market, trade unions, the industrial relations system and the education and training system, which all interact with each other at some level.

The different types of economic and VET systems are based on a 'low skill, low quality equilibrium' (LSE) or a 'high skill, high quality equilibrium' (HSE). The former (LSE) is characterised by, amongst other things:

- capital's lack of long term human resources planning;
- incoherent VET policies and a fragmented accreditation system which restricts mobility between VET institutions;
- the absence of a successful export orientated internationally competitive manufacturing sector;
- low education attainment level for the majority of workers in the economy.

A defining feature of the HSE is its successful transition to post-Fordist methods of production and competition. Sweden, Japan, Singapore, Germany and South Korea are characteristic of HSE countries, while Britain and the USA fall into the LSE category. Numerous comparative studies which place the macro political-economic system at the centre

of their analysis have highlighted the conditions under which HSE and LSE systems emerge (Kraak, 1991).

What has become evident is that market or demand-led restructuring of VET is based on reforming ET in isolation to changes in key social institutions that impact on VET, such as the labour market and the workplace. Any switch to an HSE system would therefore necessitate a comprehensive and integrated strategy with a supply side focus which would entail institutional changes to the production process, the labour market and the VET system.

THE SOUTH AFRICAN ECONOMY - THE LAST THREE DECADES

Regulation theory is also useful in explaining the South African economic crisis. The kernel of the theory attempts to explain capitalism's ability to survive successive crises. Marxist debate has long been characterised by attempts at explaining economic crises. Most theories have concentrated on the possible causes of fluctuations in the rate and path of capital accumulation. In focusing on a specific feature of the capital accumulation process, be it production or distribution, and not on the overall process, these theories are unable to explain capitalism's repeated survival of major crises. Regulation theory, by focusing on how the market as an institutional process changes over time, attempts to show how capitalism mutates, becoming stronger rather than weaker, after successive crises.

Over the last three decades, the SA economy passed through three main periods. The first one, from the early 1960s to the mid 1970s, saw the economy grow at a phenomenal rate, second only to Japan. The remainder of the 1970s saw the growth rate slow down with a concomitant economic recession. This decline was halted briefly by a boom between 1978 and 1982. This served as a brief respite to a decline characterised by a deep recession in the mid-1980s, which saw negative employment growth from which the economy has only recently showed signs of recovery (Hindson and Crankshaw, 1990:27).

During these three periods the economy underwent enormous structural changes. Agriculture and mining declined in importance as a source of employment and were replaced by

manufacturing, commerce and finance. These changes within the different sectors also highlighted other important issues. Those sectors which shrank employed many unskilled African workers who bore the brunt of the mass retrenchments that coincided with the period of economic decline.

By the end of the 1980s there were far fewer unskilled jobs (in relative terms) and more semi-skilled and skilled jobs. During this period, unskilled jobs declined from about 300 000 to under 200 000, while semi-skilled jobs increased from 400 000 to 800 000 (Hindson and Crankshaw, 1990:29). The biggest change in the occupational and racial structure was the movement of African workers from unskilled into semi-skilled jobs. By 1987, most African workers in the formal sector were semi-skilled. However, the early 1990s saw an increase in retrenchments in most sectors. In 1991 retrenchments were particularly high; engineering (35 000), mining (40 000), furniture (10% of jobs lost) and civil engineering (60 000 jobs lost over two years) (Bennell, 1992:19).

The world economic recession, the uncompetitiveness of South African products on the world market, sanctions and disinvestment and increasing trade union militancy, all contributed to decreasing profits and investment for South African industry. A way out of this malaise for many employers was through education and training programmes for workers which would not only increase their skills and productivity but more importantly, increase company profits.

By the 1970s, economic ownership and power had become concentrated in the hands of a few companies. This concentration is best shown in the South African iron and steel sector where in 1979, 5% of the companies employed

ED 419 088

THE INTEGRATION OF EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN SOUTH AFRICA WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF LABOUR MARKET THEORIES AND GLOBALISATION

By Nisaar Mahomed

EPU Working Paper No. 11
December 1996

Education Policy Unit
University of Natal
Durban

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

CE0761127

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

TA Kahlosar

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2B

2

75% of the workers in that sector and owned 88% of total assets (Kraak and von Holdt, 1990:17). The financial power of these companies allowed them to modernise rapidly and this often involved importing new machinery and expanding production. The offshoot of this was that a large proportion of production processes became highly mechanised which required workers with new skills.

Historically, training has been racially determined, with whites being the main recipients of company and state training programmes. Training for African workers at all levels of the production process was negligible. In 1982, 92.9% of artisans and 87.6% of technicians employed in the industrial sector in South Africa were white while, a mere 3.1% of artisans and 6.9% of technicians were African. The number of African apprentices actually declined from 741 in 1982 to 582 a mere four years later (Kraak and von Holdt,1990:17).

In an attempt to address this skills shortage the government passed a new law (the Training Act of 1990) wherein the state relinquished control of training to employer and worker organisations. This law initiated the establishment of Industry Training Boards (ITBs) which would control training in each industry. This change in the law was, in part, a response to numerous factors which had combined to create a skills shortage in the manufacturing (especially metal) industry.

The Shift from Fordism to Post-Fordism

The global depression of 1973 - 1975 inaugurated a change in capitalism's development. The post-World War II boom (which lasted roughly twenty years) that preceded this

depression was characterised by strong growth rates, relatively low unemployment, controlled inflation and stable exchange rates and commodity prices in most advanced capitalist countries (Harvey, 1991). Whatever technological and organisational change existed during this period consisted of a gradual deployment of older technological systems developed before World War Two.

US hegemony and the clearly defined geo-politics of the Cold War had cemented this capitalist world order militarily, economically and politically. The depression rapidly changed all this. This period witnessed low growth rates in western economies (2.2% from 1973 to 1988), high unemployment, rampant inflation and the breakdown of the US hegemony which had lasted from 1945 to 1973 (Harvey, 1991).

Suddenly capitalist economies were forced to readjust and restructure. This readjustment on the part of corporations involved technological change (computerisation, telecommunications), financial restructuring, product innovation and, most importantly as far as workers were concerned, the reorganisation of production techniques (such as the Japanese 'just in time'[1] delivery system).

Together with containerisation and jet cargo transport, the 1970s and 1980s saw the global dispersion of production, including components and parts. Not only did competition exist within countries (between companies and industries) but also internationally. The battle lines were drawn in the 1970s and pitted the US, West Germany and Italy against the newly

[1] In the manufacturing sector (Toyota being a well known example) the 'just in time' system ensures that components are delivered to the factory upon request and utilised in the assembly procedure that same day.

industrialising countries like South Korea, Singapore, Taiwan and Mexico.

These shifts in the capitalist organisation of production, consumption and accumulation had far reaching consequences for the functioning of labour markets, for work styles and labour skills. Debates regarding the nature of these shifts have often used phrases like post-Fordism and flexible specialisation (itself a contradiction in terms). There appears to be widespread agreement that while the prefix 'post' indicates an epochal transformation it actually suggests more clarity regarding that which has been left behind rather than that which has emerged to take its place. It is important to establish the roots of post-Fordism and to determine where it has come from and it is therefore to Fordism that we briefly turn.

Fordism

One of the ironies of the 1930s Great Depression is that it gave birth to this century's most vigorous capitalist growth. Many of the dominant firms in the capitalist world approximated the Fordist model. Fordism is an industrial era derived essentially from innovations at the point of production. The main forces behind this were a control system derived from Frederick Taylor's Scientific Management and a form of work organisation and technology associated with Henry Ford, the motor car manufacturer.

Using time and motion studies, Taylor divided traditionally complex labour tasks into their component parts, thus forcing workers into repetitive tasks requiring lit le, if any, skill. Ford entrenched control over the labour process by introducing

conveyors and handling devices that guaranteed the movement of materials from worker to worker and controlled production speed. There were four principles underpinning the Fordist production model and these will be summarised.

Unlike craft production (which preceded Fordism), where each part was specially designed, made and fitted, Fordism embraced the ethos of standardisation, from the various components of the product, through to the tasks needed to make the product, down to the final product itself. Some tasks were mechanised, with mass production plants developing special purpose machinery for each model and the development of the flowline meant that instead of workers moving to and from the product (which was regarded as too time consuming), the product flowed past the workers.

Lastly, Taylor's scientific management meant that tasks were broken down into their component parts, redesigned on time and motion principles by work study specialists, who then instructed manual workers on the correct way to perform the task. The Fordist model consisted of giant firms using single purpose machinery which, by separating mental and manual labour, engaged in mass production and were therefore able to flood the market with standardised products (Kraak, 1991; Murray, 1990; Smith, 1993).

This revolutionary production system which transformed sector after sector, from processed food to clothing, came to dominate the first half of the twentieth century. Fordism was essentially demand driven and the demands were essentially shaped by the growth of advertising and the mass media. Social theorists are in unison that the shift away from the Fordist system of manufacturing in the 1960s represents one

of the most significant developments in modern capitalism (Smith, 1993:39).

Post-Fordism

Fordism, being demand driven, was particularly vulnerable to variations in consumption patterns. Mass production presupposed uniform mass consumption but demand was often volatile and fragmented. Production was concentrated in large factories and workplace resistance from increasing numbers of dissatisfied deskilled workers performing repetitive tasks led to a rapid decline in productivity. This in turn, drove down investment and, together with the 1973 OPEC-led fuel price hike, presented capitalism with its greatest crisis since the 1930s. A solution was to be found in a new mode of development that could regulate these new developments and ensure relative stability.

Smith (1993) contends that the strongest alternative to Fordism emerged in Japan during the 1960s, where firms evolved a new model of manufacturing, characterised by shorter production runs, 'just in time' delivery systems, close relationships with suppliers and greater attention to variations in consumer demand. For example, in the retail sector inventories are slashed to absolute minimum levels (Murray, 1990:45). This new model of production has not only crossed sectoral boundaries but geographic ones, with entire countries embracing it either in part or in its entirety. This model is in the process of 'proving its superiority in the global market' (Smith, 1993:40) largely as a result of it being copied by the newly industrialising countries.

Having destroyed industrial unions in the 1950s, Japanese companies developed a core of multi-skilled workers whose tasks went beyond manufacture and maintenance to include product improvement. These workers are trained in statistical techniques, monitoring and quality assurance. In this new post-Fordist model:

> *the worker is designed to act as a computer as well as a machine* (Murray, 1990:46).

The obvious consequence of this is that workers gather experience, are highly motivated and are subject to continuous training. Capitalism no longer scours for fresh reserves of cheap, unskilled workers but is intent upon investing in its human capital. Companies, ever on the lookout for more sustainable profit, have quickly realised that this can be achieved through a smaller but highly skilled workforce - the very antithesis of the large Fordist plants -that is able to perform different specialised jobs. A smaller workforce also implies flexibility and increased profits. It inevitably leads to:

> *massive displacement and deskilling of unskilled and semi-skilled labour coupled with the emergence of new forms of labour market segmentation with a much smaller core of relatively high paid 'permanent' workers and a periphery of low paid 'temporary' workers* (Bennell, 1992a:6).

South African companies only began to see the benefits of the switch from Fordism in the early 1990s, once the date for the implementation of the General Agreement of Tariffs and Trade (GATT) began to draw close and the threat of foreign

competition loomed ominously large.[2] This meant that South Africa would have to join the global market and reduce its protective tariffs (amongst the highest in the world) so that foreign countries and firms could compete in South Africa. Obviously, if South Africa was unprepared for this competition then the country would inevitably experience massive company closures and retrenchments.

The Impact Of Technological Developments On Education And Training

At the beginning of the 1990s, emphasis was placed on studying the effects of the 'new technologies' on human resource policies of the world's industrialised and rapidly developing economies. An intermediate economy like that of South Africa, whose industrial growth and employment had declined during the 1980s, was particularly vulnerable to technological changes sweeping across most of the developed world.

The new technologies are divided into five categories: information, materials, space, nuclear and bio-technology. Information technology (IT) has been the most significant of the new generic fields, with its economic and employment implications (Archer, 1992:3). Rapid technological change over the past three decades, especially of computer based technologies, together with changes in the nature of markets for consumer and intermediate goods, has forced industrialised countries to look for ways to improve the

[2] The General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT), a global agreement wherein countries agree to reduce import tariffs, thereby facilitating trade between them. It is now called the World Trade Organisation.

flexibility of their workforces and to make them more broadly skilled and retrainable.

The acknowledged leaders in this regard, Germany and Japan, developed training systems that revealed a high level of concern for productivity growth and for the adaptability of the workforce in the face of rapid technological progress. Compared to the highly literate, skilled and motivated Japanese, US employers discovered a high incidence of illiteracy and innumeracy amongst workers with high school diplomas. In the Japanese system, training was not separated from work organisation and workers at all levels of the organisation were treated as a fixed cost. This meant that there would be permanent and continuous upgrading of workers' capabilities and multi-skilling through the rotation of employees between departments.

In Germany, two types of training, apprenticeship and further training, complemented each other. The former ensured the transferability of skills through a combination of on-the-job training (4 days per week) and vocational school training (1 day per week), so that by the mid-1980s, close on 66% of the German workforce had credentials of general validity (Archer, 1992). In Germany, industry associations were responsible for facilitating the funding of training and this is suggested as a reason for the success of their system.

Archer (1992) characterises South Africa as a follower, rather than an innovator, in the sequence of technological change. He argues that central to human resource development is the issue of multi-skilling. This is crucial in a world where the level of labour costs matters less than rapid innovation and reliable responses in production. The new reality in manufacturing (lean production, flexible specialisation, post-

Fordism) implies a paradigm shift away from purely functional skills towards an emphasis on skills as a generalised resource which can be utilised in various ways.

Following Archer, state involvement in the training arena, either by subsidising the activity or by taxing those companies that refused to comply, is essential. Thus, ITBs are of crucial importance for human resource development since they provide the main institutional framework for industrial training.

TRAINING BOARDS IN SOUTH AFRICA

Of the many papers produced at the 1992 National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) Conference, two are particularly noteworthy as they revolve around the area of training and its future prospects. They are *Industrial Training Boards in SA: Performance and prospects* and *Industrial training in the new SA: Some lessons for the LICs and MICs* (late and mature industrialising countries), both by Paul Bennell. South Africa, according to Bennell, lacks a training culture. There are many factors contributing to this, including the 'short termism' (lack of long term financial planning) of South African industry and the apartheid state's voluntarist industrial training policies.

Equally important in this regard is the inward orientation of the import substitution industrialisation policy which, together with the racially segmented labour markets, ensures that industry does not prioritise workforce training.

The 1980s witnessed an alarming decline in the annual registration of artisans, prompting the *Investigation into the Training of Artisans in South Africa* (NTB/HSRC, 1985). One of its recommendations was for the replacement of the time-based apprenticeship system with competency-based modular training (CBMT). This recommendation was only acted upon five years later when the Industrial Training Boards were given the statutory right to introduce a training levy payable by all employers in an industry.

It was hoped that this would improve a dismal situation where, in 1990, a mere 0.4% of total turnover was used for training by South African industries, as opposed to 3% of

turnover in the late industrialising countries (Bennell, 1992a:ll). Equally alarming was the Department of Manpower's 1991/2 budgetary allocation for formal sector training which represented just 2.18% of total public and private expenditure on industrial training.

In the light of this, Bennell concluded that there needed to be some mechanism to resolve the issues of horizontal accreditation across industries, the portability of certificates and the messy interface between education and training. In his second paper he noted the enormous strides that had been made by the countries described as LICs and MICs by co-ordinating human resource planning and skill training. This co-ordination created strong, centralised human resource development agencies that were part of, or closely linked to, the ministries responsible for overall economic planning.

What the LICs and MICs and even 'low skill' countries like the US and UK found was that unless schools and firms changed the way workers were trained over their lifetime, no amount of macroeconomic fine tuning or technological innovation would be capable of producing significantly improved economic performance. These radical changes would obviously need to include comprehensive, planned provision of quality education and training. For Bennell it was crucial that there was integration between education and training, a point picked up and amplified by other theorists such as Bird (1990).

An increasingly integrated world economy demanded (and was heavily dependent upon) workforces capable of continually changing skills, which would in turn ensure the successful implementation of the new flexible automation technologies.

Continuous learning needs to be based on a process of skill formation which is broader than mere training. This approach includes career pathing that has steps defined by skills acquisition and an industrial relations system that pays attention to career development. In order for firms to benefit from technological changes, they need complex transformations of their division of labour and their training systems need to complement the education system.

The norm among LICs is the provision of high quality general education for all children as the basis for sound industrial training. In some cases, school based technical education has been downgraded since the 1990s, while in others (such as Taiwan during the 1980s), a high proportion of secondary students attend vocational schools (Bennell, 1992a:7). The prevailing belief among MICs is that school-based technical education along narrow occupational lines does not resolve the crises attending industrialisation.

Interestingly, irrespective of which MIC or LIC is under discussion, there seems to be some relationship between the formal schooling system and the training provided by technikons and colleges. Unlike the MICs, in which the state has an ambivalent attitude (whether voluntarist in Britain or interventionist in Japan) regarding its involvement in industrial training, in the East Asian LICs the state monitors training provision, often intervening when necessary. Singapore's 'low wage, low skill' policy of the 1970s changed after the state intervened by restructuring the vocational and training system. By the end of that decade a training levy equal to 2% of the payroll was introduced, a move which greatly increased the country's productivity (Bennell, 1992a:8).

Starting in the 1950s, most LICs initiated major training programmes which depended for their success on an interface with the formal training system. Nevertheless, by the early 1990s most LICs and MICs were still using a qualification system that was defined according to the tripartism of general academic education, technical education and VET. However, it is difficult to distinguish between technical and general education at the more theoretical end and between technical and vocational education at the less theoretical end. The offshoot of this is that new forms of ET provision and a related qualification system which correspond with rapidly changing labour market requirements need to be developed.

By the 1990s it was seen as imperative that South Africa address the interface between its archaic training system and differentiated formal education system which still adhered to many basic Verwoedian tenets on which it was initially constructed.

The Fragmented Vet System

In 1990 South Africa's education system comprised nineteen racially divided education departments, with nine examining bodies administering close on 90 exams each year. There were also 128 technical colleges administered by 10 education departments (Kraak, 1992b:13). All training was dealt with by the Department of Manpower which had little or no relationship with the formal education system.

One consequence of such a fractured system was that there was no transferability of vocational skills on the external labour market, due to the lack of a certification council in the

non-formal sector. The situation was made worse by the fact that no recognised qualification structure existed for the non-formal vocational training sector. Training was seldom certificated or recognised outside of a specific industry or enterprise and was not intended as a vehicle for developing defined career paths for the majority of its black recipients. By establishing separate certification councils, the SA Certification Council for formal school qualifications and the Certification Council for technical education, the state effectively jettisoned any immediate attempts at establishing an integrated certification council. (Kraak, 1991:13).

THE STATE AND EDUCATIONAL REFORM

Between June 1991 and November 1992, three national education policy documents were released by the Department of National Education. These were: the *Education renewal strategy: a discussion document* (June 1991), the *Education renewal strategy* (November 1992)[3] and *A curriculum model for education in South Africa: a discussion document* (CUMSA) (November 1991), all being continuations of de Lange's *Investigation into the provision of education in the Republic of South Africa* (1981).

There were three areas of continuity with de Lange that emerged from these documents. The first was the recurriculation of the school syllabi, the second concerned shifting the balance between academic and vocational education in favour of the latter. The last involved the issue of enhancing student mobility by redesigning the institutional character of the post-school sector. These documents showed important shifts in state thinking in each of these areas.

De Lange's primary concern was that a more differentiated curriculum would have a dual effect; it would encourage the 'modernisation of cultures' and also the development of skills and values appropriate to the rapidly developing technological world. Other state sectors took their lead from de Lange and began to look at the link between school based education and post-school training.

The 1985 NTB/HSRC *Investigation into artisan training in South Africa* recommended greater employer involvement in

[3] For convenience, these will be referred to as the ERS documents.

the formulation of school subjects which would ultimately be accredited towards apprenticeships. Six years later their *Investigation into a national training strategy for the Republic of South Africa* (NTB/HSRC, 1991) went one step further and advocated that the Private Sector Education Council (PRISEC) should have an input in the curriculum design process.

This demand for employer participation in curriculum design was also supported by other state reports. Chief amongst them was Walters' report (1990), *The evaluation and promotion of career education*, which called for the involvement of commerce, industry and the relevant occupational groups in curriculum design. This call was echoed by the November 1992 ERS document.

In 1989 the President's Council published *A strategy and action plan to improve productivity in the Republic of South Africa* which argued for a substantial adjustment to South Africa's education system to remedy the country's low productivity ethos. The approach of the President's Council, Walters and ERS was to place the capitalist work ethic at the centre of the recurriculation process. Significantly this was the first time that South Africa's education philosophy had been freed from its narrow Verwoerdian ideals. It was relocated instead in the broader ambit of 'free market' capitalist ideology (Kraak, 1992c:11).

Another area of continuity with de Lange emerged in the state's education reform documents was the need to shift the balance between academic and vocational education in favour of the latter. De Lange blamed the overtly academic bias of South Africa's education system for producing a value system that was unrelated to the world of work and therefore

proposed vocational education as a solution. He suggested that students exit the formal schooling system after six years of compulsory education to enter the world of work, where they would complete a further three years in the non-formal training sector. His education and training argument was driven by a 'low skill equilibrium' approach that placed importance on cost-led, job-specific and narrow forms of education and training alongside the need to develop the appropriate work ethics and behavioural attributes (HSRC, 1981).

This differed sharply from the Walters (1990) and ERS (1991) reports. Drawing on debates around the diversified (vocational and academic) curricula of the third world, Walters argued that the rise of high skill technologies and skill intensive forms of work organisation in the global economy necessitated a broad general education. The report quoted a 1989 speech by the Director-General of the British Confederation of Industries which called for broad-based education and training as opposed to narrow, job-specific vocationalism.

Unlike de Lange, Walters called for ten years compulsory schooling. This report had a significant influence on the ERS documents.[4] ERS did not differentiate between general and vocationally-orientated education but supported a continuum of choices that would include a selection of both.

The third area of continuity with de Lange concerned enhancing student mobility by reshaping the institutional character of the post-school sector. A chief concern of de

[4] Dr Walters, Director of the Cape Department of Education (white), chaired the ERS group that looked at the links between formal and non-formal education.

Lange was formal education's rigid character, which prevented learners from moving across different educational sectors. In trying to find a solution he turned to Taiwan which was producing 876 technicians and 341 engineers for every million of its population. South Africa's comparative output was 78 and 37 respectively (Kraak, 1992c:20).

De Lange proposed a five year college (similar to Taiwan's) which would address the country's chronic skills shortage at the middle and high person power levels. Although diluted by the state, these proposals represented the first attempt at finding institutional solutions to human resource deficiencies. Following de Lange's lead, the ERS documents proposed the establishment of 'edukons' (essentially technical colleges upgraded into colleges of further education) which would, among other things, offer transfer credits for study at university and technikons and would facilitate greater flow between the post-secondary and tertiary sectors.

The ERS authors argued that it should be possible for technical college students to obtain credits for further study in technikon or even university education. Edukon would be one such institution where such 'transference' would occur. Employer organisations such as PRISEC entered the fray and argued for the adequate transferability of credits between different educational institutions. By emphasising the articulation rather than the fragmentation of the post secondary and tertiary sector, the PRISEC position closely resembled the education and training positions taken by the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) at its 1991 congress.

The Business Option

According to Godsell, a senior executive of the Anglo American Corporation of South Africa (in McGregor and McGregor, 1992), the modern state, by investing in education, ensured an inter-generational transfer from present to future tax payers. He cited a 21-country survey which found that the key variables for high and sustained levels of economic growth was the 'quality adjusted' nature of the labour force.

Besides being a funding agency, the government needed to ensure that there was a common level of certification of educational achievement. Many employers perceived differences between school leaving certificates that emanated from the different departments. Godsell argued that the first step towards establishing this common level of certification would be to endorse nationally attested standards of literacy and numeracy which would be followed by tests in 'core' skills such as language and mathematics.

By providing ambiguous answers regarding the role of government as actual provider, manager and presenter of education, Godsell merely reiterated the views of big business, i.e. that society's interests would be best served if government's role were diminished in favour of market forces.

Godsell argued that future jobs should engage the 'whole person' in order to achieve the desired quality adjusted labour force. Employers had ultimate responsibility for developing people trained to perform specific industrial tasks. Thus employers, particularly those concerned with medium term survival and growth, would find an integrated education and training system essential. The system should be defined by the

skill and task (and information) needs of the organisation. There should be well-defined career paths which are incremental and provide for lifelong learning and development. He argued that the technical/academic divide could be bridged by a curriculum that accommodated a combination of both.

NTB Reports And Recommendations

Another attempt at reform occurred through the National Training Boards (NTB). The two NTB/HSRC reports, *Investigation into skills training in the republic of South Africa* (1989) and *Investigation into a national training strategy for the republic of South Africa* (1991) were similar in some respects to the ERS documents of June, 1991, in that all three proposals implied a reduction in the state's role in the provisioning of VET. However there were areas of inconsistency regarding the need for a system of nationally recognised vocational qualifications and the merits of an integrated future department of education and training.

All three documents desired a single system of national qualifications accreditation in the non-formal sector as well as its articulation with the formal education system. Similarly, they all argued for learner mobility between the two systems. However, their final recommendations opted for a dual structure of accreditation rather than a unified system of national qualifications. In such a structure, vocational accreditation would occur at industry level; however, formalising the non-formal education sector through state intervention was opposed.

Both NTB reports remarked positively on the prospect of closer integration of formal education and training initiatives and also the possibility of a nationally integrated VET system. However this was not argued to finality and the reports ultimately clung to apartheid notions of separate departments 'each having differing interpretations of the character of VET' (Kraak, 1991:17).

By 1994 the NTB, with the publication of their *National training strategy initiative*, made a sweeping paradigm shift.[5] Among other things, the document called for the formation of a single Ministry of Education and Training, the modularisation of courses comprising core and optional units and the incorporation of all qualifications within an integrated credit-based system that would, in turn, form part of a. By endorsing the idea of a national qualifications framework, the NTB made a final and decisive break with past notions of dualism and entered mainstream international thinking similar to that which COSATU had been advocating for the past five years.

[5] This shift was partly due to the influence of COSATU and some of its representatives such as Adrienne Bird, who participated in these NTB deliberations.

ALTERNATIVE ECONOMIC GROWTH MODELS FOR SOUTH AFRICA

In 1990 the ANC hosted a conference in Harare to chart a course that would satisfy the major stakeholders and alliance partners. By the time the conference began, the ANC had already endorsed the 'mixed economy' concept and had turned its attention to the challenges that would emerge in the first year of the post apartheid economy (Pillay, 1990:1). It was estimated that in terms of budgetary commitment, the biggest single increase would be in the provision of adequate resources for education and training. One writer estimated that if the per capita spending on black students in primary and secondary schools was raised to only half the level for whites it would cost around R6-7 billion a year. No figures were provided for the cost of training (Pillay, 1990:5).

For Black (1990) the root of the crisis, especially in the manufacturing sector, lay in the slow growth in the domestic market, the balance of payments constraint and a lack of international competitiveness. Rapid growth of output to generate employment compatible with significantly increased wages, was needed to rescue the structurally weak and rapidly declining manufacturing sector. The re-establishment of growth and the achievement of higher levels of consumption (crucial to the survival of the economy) would require huge investments in the 'machinery, technology and training necessary to upgrade productivity on a broad scale' (Black, 1990:8).

ET Policy Initiatives from the Mass Democratic Movement (MDM)

The first major policy document to emerge from the MDM was the 13 volume *National Education Policy Investigation* (NEPI) (1992). This study, commissioned by the National Education Co-ordinating Committee (NECC), was conducted between December 1990 and August 1992 and utilised the skills of over 200 researchers. As an inquiry into policy options for a future education dispensation in South Africa, its objective was to 'interrogate policy options in all areas of education within a value framework derived from the ideals of the broad democratic movement' (NEPI, 1993: vii).

The series comprised twelve reports, each covering a major educational sector topic such as the curriculum, post secondary education and adult education. The 13th volume is a framework report and summary. However, these reports did not propose a model for a new education system, nor even make recommendations for a more equitable dispensation. As an analysis of feasible options for the short to medium-term future, they played a significant role in determining the MDM's education and training positions.[6]

Although the issue of integration was never dealt with in great detail, NEPI acknowledged that it was important to construct articulation mechanisms to ensure that:

> *technical and vocational education and training skills (TVET) are portable and certifiable, and equivalent to skills and certificates in the formal sector* (NEPI, 1993:35-36).

[6] See COSATU and ANC positions discussed below.

As a result of its systematic and comprehensive analysis this report laid the ground for future MDM investigations into restructuring of the ET system.

COSATU

COSATU's involvement in policy development revolved around the promotion of adult education and integrating training with the formal education system. In this regard, COSATU collaborated extensively with the ANC and the product of this collaboration was a working paper, *A framework for lifelong learning* (ANC/COSATU, 1993). This paper called for, among other things, an integrated approach to both formal and non-formal education and training, which would allow learners to proceed from one to the other while retaining recognition for any qualifications obtained.

The COSATU Fourth National Congress in July 1991 adopted a number of resolutions which outlined the general framework and principles underlying its policy on the transformation of the education and training system as a whole.

These VET policies were based on COSATU's economic policies which comprised two interlinked objectives, namely growth through redistribution (another form of inward industrialisation) and growth through an external, export orientation. The former entails restructuring the manufacturing sector to incorporate the production of basic consumer durables and social consumption goods such as public housing, transport and electrification schemes (COSATU, 1992b:14). This would, in turn, provide a stimulus to the country's export orientation.

COSATU's 'supply-side' focus constrasted sharply with the state's 'demand led' approach which advocated that the production process be left untouched. By rigidly enforcing 'free market' (sic) principles, both big business and the government envisaged a limited role for the state and emphasised market mechanisms. COSATU, on the other hand, would require the future state to play a strong interventionist role, especially regarding economic restructuring and VET.

For COSATU, any ET initiative would need to be linked to the twin programmes of economic transformation and industrial restructuring. These programmes would ensure clear bridges between formal education, industrial training and other ET systems. A nationally based ABE system would have clear accreditation links to the formal and nonformal sectors with progression to all sectors of VET.

According to COSATU, training should provide the basis for nationally recognised career paths. This competency-based modular training should be linked to an industry-wide grading system. Adopting the position of the National Union of Metalworkers of South Africa (NUMSA) of broadbanding (i.e. reducing) the number of grades to five up to artisan level, COSATU further stated that these grades should be based on broad general skill bands which would in turn form the basis for industry-wide, nationally recognised, portable and certificated training.

These principles were, to a large extent, influenced by the NUMSA Vocational Training Project, which sent representatives to Australia in 1990. It was found that unions played a vital role in industrial renewal during Australia's

tripartite reconstruction exercise. This entailed a radical democratisation of the economic planning process during the last few years of the 1980s. COSATU adopted the above principles at its 1991 Congress. [7]

The South African Committee for Adult Basic Education (SACABE)

In November 1993, a conference, aimed at prioritising ABE on the national agenda was held in Johannesburg. By far the most representative conference of its kind, it included mass based education organisations, tertiary institution ABE departments, trade unions, organisations of adult learners and educators and civic organisations. The conference endorsed the primacy of ABE (in the formal, non-formal and informal sectors) and argued that such a reconstituted ABE should form:

> *part of an integrated education and training system which allows mobility of learners across different institutions, contexts and subsystems ... and that it should lead to nationally recognised certificates based on clear standards assessed as broad competencies/outcomes with equivalence to other subsystems* (NABEC, 1994:57).

The national structure that emerged from this Conference, The South African Committee for Adult Basic Education

[7] The South African union movement was bolstered by the arrival of two Australian trade unionists during this time: Chris Lloyd at NUMSA, whose focus area was industrial restructuring, and Alistair Machin at COSATU's PRP unit, whose focus area was the national training strategy and the national qualifications strategy.

(SACABE), had as its primary aim the task of overseeing the implementation of a mass-scale ABE programme.The National Adult Basic Education Conference, coming practically on the eve on the country's first democratic elections, had a profound influence on subsequent debates around education and training. The following year the Reconstruction and Development Programme document emerged, with a section on Human Resource Development that was almost a replica of the views espoused at the SACABE conference.

The ANC's Education Policies

The ANC as government in waiting, unveiled its human resource policies in a document intended for the 1992 NEPI Conference. The ANC argued that a national human resource policy should be located within the ambit of broader economic restructuring.

For the ANC it was imperative that the country move towards a higher value added manufacturing export economy in the medium to longer-term. This would coincide with a drastic investigation into training and education policies which would be located contextually within the need for basic education and for designing technical training modules across industries. The ANC argued for the integration of ET policies within the framework of economic reconstruction, in line with its objectives of human resources policy which would be of:

> *active labour market policies aimed to develop and direct human resources to areas of social and economic need* (ANC, 1992:4).

The ANC criticised the 'short termism' of the employers and the state who put the needs of profit before investing in human resources. Whatever investment existed was essentially market-led, both in terms of the type of training needed and in relation to economic growth or decline. The practice in the past was to import skilled labour rather than invest in local workers.

The problem was compounded by the segmented and segregated education and training system which inevitably resulted in fragmented and disjointed approaches to the provision of education, training and skills formation. Attempts at privatising training and the NTB's insistence on voluntarism regarding training made a chronic situation even worse.

Some of the problems could be ameliorated through direct state provision of education and training, which provision could:

> *not be left to the vicissitudes of the market... particularly with regards to industrial training* (ANC, 1992:5).

A national core curriculum was proposed which would emphasise the development of general (academic) skills and complement these with forms of vocational training. The emphasis on general skills was premised on two considerations. Firstly, international evidence showed that a general academic education provided a good foundation for individuals to adapt to the needs of a changing and dynamic modern economy. Secondly, by not differentiating between different types of education, the system would ensure quality of opportunity for everyone.

This national core curriculum would be complemented by a national accreditation and certification system for both formal and non-formal education and training. This would ensure maximum flexibility for horizontal and vertical mobility between the formal and non-formal sectors of the education system. The ANC also argued that the National Manpower Commission be transformed into a National Labour Commission, comprising all stakeholders in the industrial relations field. It would co-ordinate all labour matters, including policies for education and training. This conceptualisation of a nationally integrated framework had earlier been developed by Bird (1990).

This and other documents which emanated from MDM structures during this period argued for the development of a flexible entry and exit system of education and training, to be integrated within a national system of qualification and accreditation. This was intended to give learners the option of transferring nationally recognised credits between educational levels and across different industrial sectors (ANC/COSATU, 1993).

In a union training module to familiarise NUMSA shop stewards with negotiations regarding ABET within the auto and engineering industries, Bird illustrated how such a system could work by utilising concepts like core, technical and fundamental skills and even specifying the time periods that would need to be allocated to each (see appendix). In 1993, the ANC and COSATU released a discussion document titled *A framework for lifelong learning*. This document had a profound influence on other MDM structures regarding ET restructuring.

With the publication of the ANC's *Policy framework for education and training* in January 1994, the idea of an integrated system appeared to be a *fait accompli*. Whether it would eventually materialise as such was a matter for the new government. A chapter entitled 'Major policy initiatives in the next five years', revolved around the integration of ET and called for a nationally integrated system that would link one level of learning with another.

The ANC's policy stated that learners would be able to progress to higher levels from any starting point in the ET system and recognition of prior learning would be formally assessed and credited through qualifications. Lastly, the ANC proposed the establishment of a South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA) which would underpin and develop the integration and qualitative improvement of the education and training systems.

From this point on, all documents dealing with the theme of a restructured education system spoke of Education and Training as a single term, even if the authors did not necessarily subscribe to the notion of integration. For example, the proposals for a unitary KwaZulu-Natal Department of Education were presented in a 1994 report entitled *A unitary department of education and training: proposals for KwaZulu-Natal*. The document was unsurprisingly devoid of any references to the integration of ET but instead focused on the administrative integration of the province's former education departments.

Another document, published at roughly the same time by two MDM aligned education policy units, shed some light on the issue of integration. Entitled *Proposals for the restructuring of education and training in KwaZulu-Natal* (EPU/MEPU,

1994), it stressed the urgency of integration and analysed mechanisms, both provincially and nationally, that could expedite such an endeavour.[8] Such mechanisms included a provincial education and training forum (PETF).

The Government of National Unity's Education Policies

Upon assuming power as the dominant partner in a Government of National Unity, the ANC began to revisit its pre-election policy recommendations. The White paper on Education and Training (DoE, 1995)[9] recognised the value of developing an integrated approach in order to achieve an overall strategy for human resource development and the democratisation of society. There was no stipulation that education and training needed to be collapsed into a unitary structure but rather that separate organisational structures would co-exist within a common approach to education and training.

A crucial element of the system outlined in the White Paper was the development and acceptance of a national qualifications framework (NQF) and an accrediting authority, the SAQA. These were to be developed together with an 'overarching curriculum development process as envisaged in the [ANC] proposed National Institute for Curriculum Development' (Motala, 1995:3).

[8] It was a joint effort of the Macro Education Policy Unit at the University of Durban-Westville and the Education Policy Unit at the University of Natal, Durban, in association with the Centre for Education Policy Development.

[9] The first Education White Paper (1995) reflected a shift in emphasis from the integration of ET to 'an integrated approach to ET' primarily due to pressure from the National Party and old bereaucrats.

In 1995, the Minister of Education published the South African Qualifications Authority Act (No. 58 of 1995)[10] for general information and comment. The White Paper on Education and Training (1995) endorsed an integrated approach to ET and proposed the NQF and the SAQA as the instruments to achieve this integration.

The NQF will link all levels of learning, giving learners access to different levels. It will also provide a coordinating mechanism for disparate learning institutions and enable learners to progress to higher levels from any starting point in the system (Maharajh, 1995:2). This ties in with the White Paper's (1994) conception of an integrated approach to ET wherein one level of learning is linked to another and in the process, enables successful learners to progress to higher levels from any starting point in the ET system.

The SAQA Act provides for the establishment of SAQA as a parastatal body responsible for developing the NQF. SAQA is also responsible for the registration of national standards, ensuring that accreditation requirements are met and that standards and registered qualifications are internationally comparable (Maharajh, 1995:7).

Despite the legislation and apparent progress towards the integration of ET, it must be borne in mind that institutional structures alone cannot guarantee the successful implementation of the integration programme. Success will be dependent on the co-operation of the different sectors, higher and adult education, training and the various government ministries responsible for such an endeavour.

[10] Hereafter referred to as the SAQA Act.

The development of SAQA and NQF were, to some extent, prefaced by the establishment of an Inter-Ministerial Working Group consisting of, among others, the Ministries of Education and Labour, following a meeting on 3 June 1994 between these two ministers. The aim of this Working Group was to 'give effect to the agreement for an integrated approach to education and training' which was regarded as instrumental to the government's Reconstruction and Development Programme (Inter-Ministerial Working Group 1994:1).

The organisations which supported the move towards an integrated approach to education and training were briefly: the ANC (in its *Policy framework for education and training*, 1995, and also its *Implementation plan for education and training*, 1994); COSATU (adopted as policy at its National Congress in 1991); PRISEC (which appealed for integration through both NTB and NETF); NTB (made similar appeals in 1991); the ITB (endorsed the concept following the publication of the National Training Strategy Initiative (NTSI) and the NETF (their Founding Agreement endorsed this integration as a key principle).

Further, the Inter-Ministerial Working Group recommended that the Ministry of Education be renamed the Ministry of National Education and Training. Such a ministry could then take over those training functions of the Ministry of Labour which related to curriculum, standards, qualifications and research and development.

By the time the White Paper on Education and Training (1995) was published, this had not happened and Training appeared to be a mere appendage to the title of the policy

document, which focused almost exclusively on the formal school system. However, in May 1995 a national stakeholders' forum agreed that the absence of a national framework for provision and accreditation constituted a stumbling block to the implementation of ABET programmes. The following month, The Minister of Education tasked a national working group with the development of an interim framework for ABET. In July 1995 this group completed a framework report called *A national curriculum framework and standard setting for ABET.* [11]

[11] The main sources for the section of the report entitled *A Curriculum framework for ABET in SA* were three documents published in 1994: the NTB's *National training strategy initiative*, The ANC's *Implementation plan for education and training* and the National Adult Basic Education Conference's *Coming in from the cold*.

INTERNATIONAL INFLUENCES

The policy making process was greatly affected (some would say hindered) by external influences, most notably from Australia and England. For the remainder of this paper it is appropriate to identify those influences and examine their effect on the policy outcomes, albeit very briefly.

As indicated earlier the trade unions, through NUMSA with its Vocational Training Project (Bird, 1990:15), were instrumental in kickstarting the process on the MDM's side through a series of study trips in countries as diverse as Zimbabwe, Sweden, Italy, Australia and England. NTB, in preparation for the NTSI, visited many of the same countries but added Germany and three rapidly industrialising nations: Brazil, Malaysia and Singapore (McGrath, 1995:215).

Despite this vast geographic sweep, the influences from many of the African and MIC countries were minimal. Instead, Australia and the UK provided the most systematic and enduring influence in shaping South Africa's education and training policy.

Unlike British and North American trade unions which sought to resist the pressure for technological change, the Australians decided to utilise such change for the mutual benefit of employers and employees. Australian unions supported South African initiatives through exchange visits and in this way were able to clarify the complexities of industrial restructuring and links between industrial competitiveness and a sound ET system. Similarly, Australia's experiences proved

useful in the debate around competencies and also in the NTSI deliberations.[12]

British experiences influenced South African developments in two ways. The first was the government agency, the National Council for Vocational Qualifications (NCVQ) which impacted on the thinking of the Department of Labour and Business SA and, more importantly, on the Hospitality Industry Training Board. This Board decided to base its national qualifications on the British National Vocational Qualification's competency-based levels 1 to 3 (McGrath, 1995:217). As is the case in Australia, the necessary standards and competencies are decided upon by industry lead bodies (standard setting bodies).

The second influence on South African thinking was through the Institute of Public Policy Research (IPPR) and academics such as Michael Young, who were commissioned by the Centre for Education Policy Development (CEPD) and the National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI). Further, Andre Kraak utilised the work of the IPPR team while working on NEPI's HRD report.

The IPPR maintained that education and training needed to be governed by a single assessment system and overseen by a national qualifications authority. Further, such a system should ultimately be answerable to a unified Ministry of Education and Training. The IPPR recommended a modular system comprising three parts: core, specialised and work/community based. This system is similar to the one currently being developed in South Africa (see appendix).

[12] See EPU Working Paper No. 10 entitled *Competence: past debates, future problems*, published by the Education Policy Unit, University of Natal, Durban.

CONCLUSION

This paper has shown that education and training policy does not occur in a vacuum but is the result of an interplay between various forces within society. Training has become a point of debate and contestation due to South Africa's political dynamic, its relationship with the outside world and changes in the global (and in some cases national) production process, which necessitated attention to the restructuring of the training system.

This brief survey of proposals regarding mobility within the post-secondary and tertiary education sectors has also shown the high degree of commonality that existed between unions, the ANC, the state and employers. Besides obvious areas of difference, they were united in their demand for greater student flow within an enlarged post-secondary education and training sector. What divided them was the extent to which cross institutional accreditation would provide effective linkages with the various post-secondary institutions.

Much work is being done at present on developing curriculum frameworks for general and further education and training, adult basic education and training, and on the relationship between lifelong learning and the National Qualifications Framework. Attempts are underway to define new relationships between the Department of Labour and Industry Training Boards. At the provincial level, discussions on various bills such as for technical colleges, are still taking place.

Despite all this activity, there is no evidence that any realistic attempt is being made to ensure that the integration of

education and training is effected. The Inter-Ministerial Group that was established for precisely this reason has seldom met and it would appear that education and training will still operate along separate paths for the forseeable future.

Evidence suggests that Training Boards are still following guidelines issued by the Department of Labour while the Education Department is seemingly oblivious to current debates around issues such as competence which are central to many Training Board discussions. It would appear that not only are these two departments avoiding each other, but they have scheduled different priorities for the immediate future.

LIST OF WORKS CITED

African National Congress (ANC) Dept. of Human Resources Development. 1992. Human resources policy for a new South Africa. Paper prepared for the National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) Conference: Human Resources Policy for a New South Africa, Durban 7-10 May. (Unpublished).

African National Congress (ANC)/Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU). 1993. A framework for lifelong learning: a unified, multi-path approach to education and training. Braamfontein: Education Department, ANC.

African National Congress (ANC). May, 1994. Implementation of education and training. Braamfontein: Education Department, ANC.

African National Congress (ANC). 1994. *Report of the Task Team for Adult Basic Education and Training.* In Implementation plan for Education and Training. Education Department, ANC.

African National Congress (ANC). 1995. A policy framework for education and training. Manzini: Macmillan Boleswa.

Archer, S. 1992. Technological development and the education and training of the labour force in South Africa. Paper prepared for the National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) Conference: Human Resources Policy for a New South Africa, Durban 7-10 May. (Unpublished).

Bennell, P. 1992a. Industrial training in the new South Africa: some lessons from the LICS and MICS. Paper prepared for the National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI)

Conference: Human Resources Policy for a New South Africa, Durban 7-10 May. (Unpublished).

Bennell, P. 1992b. Industrial Training Boards in South Africa: performances and prospects. Paper presented to National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) Conference: Human Resources Policy for a New South Africa, Durban 7-10 May. (Unpublished).

Bird, A. 1990. *NUMSA's vocational training project.* SA Labour Bulletin, 15(1):10-15.

Black, A. 1990. Discussion paper on alternative growth models for South Africa. Paper presented at Workshop on Future Economic policy for SA, Harare, April. (Unpublished)

Bromley, S. 1991. *The politics of postmodernism.* Capital and Class, 45:129-150.

Callinicos, A. 1989. Against postmodernism: a Marxist critique. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU). 1992a. COSATU's approach to Adult Basic Education. Produced for the National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) Adult Basic Education Commission and the National Education Policy Investigation Human Resources Conference. (Unpublished).

Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU). 1992b. Report of the Economic Policy Conference, 27-29 March. (Unpublished).

Department of Education (DoE). 1994. Education and training in a democratic South Africa: first steps to develop a new system. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Department of Education (DoE) 1994. Draft white paper on education and training. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Department of Education (DoE) 1995. White paper on education and training. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Department of National Education (DNE). June, 1991. Education renewal strategy (ERS): discussion document. Pretoria: DNE.

Department of National Education (DNE). Nov, 1991. A curriculum model for education in South Africa: discussion document (CUMSA). Pretoria: Committee of Education Heads.

Department of National Education (DNE). Nov, 1992. Education renewal strategy (ERS): management solutions for education in South Africa. Pretoria: DNE

Education Policy Unit/Macro-Education Policy Unit (EPU/MEPU). 1994. Proposals for the Restructuring of Education and Training in KwaZulu-Natal (PREK).Durban: Indicator Press.

Finegold, D. and Soskice, D. 1991. *The failure of training in Britain: analysis and prescription.* In Esland, G. Education, Training and Employment, vol.1. Wockingham: Open University.

FitzGerald, P. 1990. Post-apartheid South Africa: regional economic policy. ANC Seminar on Economic Policy, Harare, Zimbabwe. (Unpublished).

Gelb, S. 1991. South Africa's Economic Crisis. Cape Town: David Philip.

Harvey, D. 1991. *Flexibility: threat or opportunity.* Socialist Review, 21(1):65-77.

Hindson, D. and Crankshaw, O. (1990) *New jobs, new skills, new divisions: the changing structure of South Africa's workforce.* SA Labour Bulletin, 15(1):23-31.

Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC). July, 1981. Provision of education in the Republic of South Africa: report of the main committee of the HSRC Investigation into Education. (de Lange Commission). Pretoria: HSRC.

Inter-Ministerial Working Group. 1994. Memorandum of the Inter-Ministerial Working Group established by the Minister of Education and the Minister of Labour Affairs, June. (Unpublished).

Kallaway, P. 1992. Vocational education for all in the new South Africa? Cape Town: School of Education, University of Cape Town.

Kaplinsky, R. 1990. *A policy agenda for Post-Apartheid South Africa.* Transformation, 12:42-52.

Kraak, A. 1991. Beyond the market: comprehensive institutional restructuring of South African labour markets, education, training and work. National Education Policy Investigation paper. (Unpublished).

Kraak, A. 1992a. An institutional approach to education and training in South Africa: the importance of segmented labour markets. Paper presented to National Education Policy Investigation Conference: Human Resources Policy for a New South Africa, Durban 7-10 May. (Unpublished).

Kraak, A. 1992b. The National Training Strategy: the triumph of market ideology. Paper presented to National Education Policy Investigation Conference: Human Resources Policy for a New South Africa, Durban 7-10 May. (Unpublished).

Kraak, A. 1992c. Assessing the Education Renewal Strategy: continuity and change in current state thinking on education in South Africa. In National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) Working Papers of the Research Group: Human Resources Development, volume 1. (1992) (Unpublished).

Kraak, A. 1994. *Lifelong learning and reconstruction: can it deliver?* SA Labour Bulletin, 18 (4): 32-39.

Kraak, A. and Von Holdt, K. 1990. *Training strategies of business and government: new opportunities for unions.* SA Labour Bulletin, 15 (1).

Maharajh, R. 1995. *The NQF for beginners.* Education Monitor, 6(3).

Motala, E. 1995. *Integration of education and training.* In Education Monitor, 6 (1).

McGrath, S. 1995. Some international trends in education and training reform and their implication for South Africa. Paper presented at the Tertiary-based Southern African Adult Education Conference: Adult Educators as Change Agents: Contributions to Social Transformation. University of Transkei, April. (Unpublished).

McGregor, R. and McGregor A. 1992. McGregor's Educational Alternatives. Johannesburg: Juta.

Murray, R. 1990. *Fordism and post-Fordism.* In Hall, S. and Jacques, M. New times: the changing face of politics in the 1990's. London: Lawrence and Wishart.

National Adult Basic Education Conference (NABEC). 1994. Coming in from the cold: putting adult basic education on the national agenda. Johannesburg: CEPD/SACHED.

National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI). 1993a. Framework report and final report summaries. Cape Town: Oxford University Press/NECC.

National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI). 1993b. Human resources development. Cape Town: Oxford University Press/NECC.

National Training Board (1994) Executive summary: a discussion document on a national training strategy investigation. (Unpublished).

National Training Board/Human Sciences Research Council (NTB/HSRC) 1985. Investigation into the training of artisans in South Africa. Pretoria: HSRC.

National Training Board/Human Sciences Research Council (NTB/HSRC) 1989. Investigation into skills training in the republic of South Africa. Pretoria: HSRC.

National Training Board/Human Sciences Research Council (NTB/HSRC) 1991. Investigation into a national training strategy for the republic of South Africa. Pretoria: HSRC.

Pillay, V. (1990) Post-apartheid South Africa: the macroeconomic perspectives for year one and beyond. ANC Seminar on Economic Policy, Harare, Zimbabwe. (Unpublished).

Smith, T. 1993. *Flexible production and the capital/wage labour relation in manufacturing.* Capital and Class, 53:39-63.

South Africa. House of Assembly. 1995. South African Qualifications Authority Act 58. Pretoria: Government Printer.

South Africa. President's Council. 1989. A strategy and action plan to improve productivity in the Republic of South Africa. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Tomaney, J. 1990. *The reality of workplace flexibility.* Capital and Class, 40:29-60.

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). 1991. Human Development Report. New York: Oxford University Press.

Walters, S.W. April, 1990. The evaluation and promotion of career education. Main report of the Committee for the Evaluation and Promotion of Career Education in the Department of Education and Culture, Administration: House of Assembly (HOA). Cape Town: HOA.

Young, M. 1992. Qualifications for a high skill future: lessons from the UK. Paper presented to National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) Conference:

Human Resources Policy for a New South Africa, Durban 7-10 May. (Unpublished).

CAREER PATH FRAMEWORK

1. **Fundamental Skills** = language and mathematics[1]
2. **Core Industry Skills** = a range of options eg health and safety, quality, ...
3. **Technical Skills** = theory and practice in areas such as welding, computing

grade		Total
6	Numbers to be negotiated.	80
5	To work at level 5 the worker must have a total of 60 modules made up of: **22 modules from the Fundamental Stream** **8 modules from the Core Industry Concepts** **30 modules from the Technical Stream** There is no choice at this level.	**total 60**
4	To work at level 4 the worker must have a total of 42 modules of which a minimum must be made up of : **14 modules from the Fundamental Stream** **6 modules from the Core Industry Concepts** **16 modules from the Technical Stream, PLUS an additional 6 modules from any one of the three.**	**total 42**
3	To work at level 3, the worker must have a total of 26 modules of which a minimum must be made up of : **6 modules from the Fundamental Stream** **4 modules from the Core Industry Concepts** **10 modules from the Technical Stream, PLUS an additional 6 modules from any one of the three.**	**total 26**
2	To work at level 2 - a worker must have completed **a total of 12 modules** of which there must be a minimum of **2 CORE and 4 TECHNICAL modules PLUS an additional 6 from any one of the 3 types.** The 6 choice modules will then count towards the minimum requirement in any one of the three categories for the movement from grade 2 to 3.	**total 12**
1	To work at level 1 there is no formal requirement	0
	Induction	

[1] A provisional set of outcome statements based on work by the IEB and ASECA, aligned to the numbers of modules indicated in the framework - have been written down by Samuel Isaacs and are appended to this report for reference.